Final Report

on external evaluation of

the cluster of educational programmes

"Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02),
"Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06),

delivered by the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Belgorod State National Research University

Belgorod, 2019

Final Report

on external evaluation of

the cluster of educational programmes

"Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02),
"Ecology and natural resources management"
(05.03.06, 05.04.06),

delivered by the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Belgorod State National Research University

Chair of the External Review Panel Lučka Lorber

Belgorod, 2019

Contents

Introduction 4

1. CONTEXT AND MAIN STAGES OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION 4

1.1. Terms of Reference 4
1.2. External Review Panel 4
1.3. Goals and objectives of the review 5
1.4. Stages of the review 6

2. DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMMES 8

3. FINDINGS 10

3.1 Standard 1. Policy (goals, objectives, development strategy) and procedures of quality assurance 10
3.2 Standard 2. Design and approval of programmes 12
3.3 Standard 3. Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment .. 13
3.4 Standard 4. Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation 15
3.5 Standard 5. Teaching staff 17
3.6 Standard 6. Learning resources and student support 20
3.7 Standard 7. Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the educational institution 22
3.8 Standard 8. Public information 24
3.9 Standard 9. On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes 26
3.10 Standard 10. Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes 27

4. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT 29

5. CONCLUSION 31

ANNEX A 32

ANNEX B 34

ANNEX C 39

THE SCALE OF ASSESSMENT PARAMETERS OF A STUDY PROGRAMME 39

Introduction

The external evaluation of the cluster of educational programmes in "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06), delivered by the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Belgorod State National Research University" (hereinafter - BelSU), took place on December 3 – 5, 2019 and included the analysis of Self Evaluation Report, a site visit to BelSU and the preparation of the Final Report.

The goal of the external evaluation is to establish the level of compliance of the cluster of degree programmes "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06), delivered by BelSU, with the standards and criteria of international public accreditation developed by the National Center for Public Accreditation (NCPA) and with the European standards and guidelines (ESG) for quality assurance in higher education (ENQA).

The Final Report on the outcomes of the external evaluation is the basis for decision making by the National Accreditation Board on professional public accreditation of the study programmes in compliance with the standards and criteria of NCPA.

1. CONTEXT AND MAIN STAGES OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION

1.1. Terms of Reference

According to item 1, 3 article 96 of the Federal Law of the Russian Federation of December 29, 2012 No.273-FZ "On education in the Russian Federation" organizations, which implement educational activities, may apply for public accreditation in various national, foreign and international institutions; employers, employer associations and designated organizations have the right to conduct public accreditation of professional educational programmes, which are delivered by an educational institution.

In order to obtain professional public accreditation of the cluster of study programmes in "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06), BelSU applied to NCPA which carries out its activity at the national level and is recognized by the leading international organizations of quality assurance in higher education.

1.2. External Review Panel

The international experts were nominated by a foreign quality assurance agency upon NCPA's request.

The Russian expert was nominated by the Guild of Experts in Higher Education.

The employer representative was nominated by the Federal state budgetary institution "State Natural Reserve "Belogorye".

The representative of the students' community was suggested by the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Gorin Belgorod State Agricultural University".

The composition of the External Review Panel was approved by NCPA.

The Review Panel included five international and national experts:

- Lučka Lorber - PhD, Associate Professor, Vice-Rector for Quality Development, Professor, Department of Geography, University of Maribor, Chair of the Slovenian Council for Higher Education, expert of the National Agency for Quality Assurance of Slovenia and the European University Association, representative of the OECD Governing Board for the Programme on Institutional Management in Higher Education (IMHE), State Secretary for Higher Education at the Ministry of Higher Education and Sport (2003-2004), member of the Steering Committee of the Commission on the Sustainability of Rural Systems of the International Geographical Union (2008-2012) — foreign expert, Review Chair;
- Aleksander Barmin - Doctor of Geography, Professor, Dean of the Faculty of Geology and Geography, Department of Ecology, Environmental and Land Management, and Health and Safety, Astrakhan State University, member of the Standing Environmental Commission of the Russian Geographical Society — Russian expert, Deputy Review Chair;
- Nikolai Kharchenko - Candidate of Geography, Senior Research Fellow, State Nature Reserve «Belogorye» — representative of professional community, Panel member;
- Aleksander Gusev - Candidate of Geography, Senior Research Fellow, State Nature Reserve "Belogorye" — representative of professional community, Panel member;
- Daria Obraztsova - 2nd year student, Faculty of Agronomy, field of study 05.04.06 «Ecology and Environmental Management», Gorin Belgorod State Agrarian University — representative of students, Panel member.

The focused expert knowledge of the Panel members, long-term experience of working in the system of higher education and profession, active position of students and employers became the basis for effective consideration of issues in the process of evaluation.

The participation of the Russian representatives of the higher education system gave an opportunity to analyze the activity of the programmes under evaluation in the context of the world trends in quality assurance and within the scope of the national educational.

1.3. Goals and objectives of the review

The purpose of public accreditation is to improve the quality of education and form quality culture in educational institutions, discovering best practices in continuous enhancing the educational quality and public information on educational institutions in accordance with the European educational quality standards.

The main goal of the peer review is to determine the correspondence of the reviewed study programmes in "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06), delivered by BelSU, to the standards and criteria of public accreditation, which are developed by NCPA in compliance with the European Standards of Quality Assurance in Education (ESG-ENQA); and to develop recommendations for the study programmes with the purpose of improving the contents and structure of the educational process.

1.4. Stages of the review

The review included three main stages:

1.4.1 Study of the Self-Evaluation report

The Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Belgorod State National Research University" was responsible for conducting the self-evaluation procedure, developing and timely submitting the Self–Evaluation Report of the cluster of educational programmes in "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06).

According to the *Guidelines on Self-evaluation of Educational Programmes*, which were developed by NCPA, The Self-Evaluation Report is written on **54** pages and includes: introduction, findings, conclusions, and annexes. The self-evaluation procedure was conducted on the basis of SWOT analysis according to every standard of NCPA.

According to the review schedule, the Self-Evaluation report of the study programmes "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06) was submitted to NCPA and mailed to the members of the review panel 30 days before the site-visit.

While studying the Self-Evaluation Report the panel members formed a preliminary opinion about the reviewed educational programmes on compliance with the standards of NCPA and criteria on accreditation and with the European standards of education quality.

The members of the review panel assessed the quality of preparation of the Self-Evaluation Report with regards to its text structuring, compliance of information with the Report's sections; quality of perception; sufficiency of analytical data; availability of references to supporting documents; completeness of information. All of these made it possible for the members of the Review Panel to formulate a preliminary opinion.

The review panel made the following conclusions on the outcomes of the preliminary analysis. The discovered weaknesses insignificantly influence the contents and implementation conditions of the cluster of educational programmes*. It is recommended that relevant measures, designed to achieve the full compliance with the specified standard, should be taken.*

According to the standards and criteria of accreditation of NCPA the preliminary assessment of the study programmes "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06) may be defined as substantial compliance: the external review panel considers that according to the specified criteria (standard) the cluster of the programmes substantially complies with the determined requirements.

The following issues need to be analyzed in detail:

- material support of the educational programmes;
- awareness of foreign students of availability of the educational programmes;
- internship;
- promotion of academic mobility of the teaching staff and students.

During the preliminary meeting the members of ERP came up with suggestions which determined the main strategy of the site visit.

1.4.2 Site visit to BelSU

The review panel visited BelSU on December 03-05, 2019 with the purpose of confirming the authenticity of the information, which was presented in the Self-Evaluation Report, collecting additional information on the implementation of the programmes under accreditation and checking their compliance with the standards and criteria of NCPA and European Standards and Guidelines for quality assurance.

The time line and the agenda of the site-visit were determined by NCPA and approved by the administration of the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Belgorod State National Research University" and the members of the Review Panel.

During the site-visit the Review Panel members conducted a number of meetings and interviews: with the University administration and people responsible for accreditation, the Director of the Institute of Earth Sciences and his Deputies, the Heads of the Department, the teachers of the Department of Geography, Geo-Ecology and Life-Safety, the Department of Nature Management and Land Cadastre, students, representatives of professional community, graduates.

The Chair of the Review Panel managed the Panel's work.

The Panel considers that the Self-Evaluation Report, which was presented by BelSU, provided the experts with an opportunity to form an integral view on specific features of implementation of the reviewed study programmes "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06).

The reviewed documents and the interviewed persons, visits to classes, Museums of Geology and Mineralogy, Biology, the History of the University, the Botanical Garden of the University, the accredited laboratories provided the Review Panel members with sufficient information about the material supply of the study programmes under accreditation.

The Review Panel considers it necessary to highlight the effective cooperation of the experts and NCPA employees during the site-visit and its preparation.

The Review Panel notes the highest level of organizational provision and constructive work.

The executive staff of BelSU provided the administrative support, which included the arrangement of meetings and interviews, provision with working space, computers with access to the Internet, necessary documents on implementation of research and academic process.

During the site-visit to BelSU the Review Panel members requested additional documents.

On the last day of the site-visit the Chair of the Review Panel presented an oral report on the general conclusions to the administrative staff of the University, Heads of the Institutes and Departments, teachers and students.

The agenda of the site-visit may be found in the Annex.

1.4.3 Conclusion on the findings of the external review

Based on the results of the external review of the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Belgorod State National Research University" the Review Panel submitted the Report on the results of the external review of the study programmes "Geography"

(05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06), delivered by the University.

The draft report of **34** pages excluding Annexes was developed by the Chair of the Review Panel, approved by the other Review panel members and submitted to the National Centre for Public Accreditation. Then the Report will be mailed to the University's administration for the correction of factual errors.

2. DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

The history of the University traces its roots in XIX century. The Teachers' University was founded on September 26, 1876 in the chief town of the district Belgorod upon the order of the Ministry of People's Education. Due to the development of higher pedagogical education in Russia and the region the HEI was renamed several times.

In 2011 the State Educational Institution of Higher Professional Education "Belgorod State University" was transformed into the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Belgorod State National Research University" (order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of February 1, 2011 N129).

Today the University is one of the biggest institutions of higher education in the Central Federal District. According to the Forbes rating, BelSU takes 59th place among all Russian HEIs, 1st place in Belgorod, 38th place in top 50 best HEIs of Russia, 8th place among the Universities located outside Moscow, Moscow region and St. Petersburg.

Over 23000 students study at the University. The University's Institutes and Faculties pay much attention to the development of partner relations with the organizations of Belgorod and the region with the purpose of improving the employability of the graduates according to their academic profile.

Two departments of the Institute of Earth Sciences – the Department of Nature Management and Land Cadastre and the Department of Geo-Ecology and Life-Safety are involved into the implementation of the programmes "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06); "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.04.06); "Geography" (05.03.02); "Geography" (05.04.02). Over 30 qualified teachers work at the departments.

The total number of the teaching staff is 76, which includes: 63 (82,9%) having scientific degrees, 11 of them (14.3%) are Doctors of Science, 1 Corresponding Member of the Russian Academy of Science (1.3%), 15 (19,7%) have working experience in the leading companies and organizations in the field of geography, ecology and nature management. The leading national and international specialists are annually invited to conduct lectures and research. The teachers of the programmes under accreditation take regular further training courses in the University and other Russian research and educational institutions.

Every educational programme has a documented mission, goals and objectives, which comply with the University's mission, the Federal State Educational Standard of Higher Education, the Federal Standards for basic labor functions. The programme's mission also takes into consideration the specific features of the University's research schools and labor market requirements. The mission, goals and objectives of the programmes are posted on the official website of the University.

Employers take an active part in designing the educational programmes. They include Belgorod Centre for Hydrometeorology and Environment Monitoring – the affiliation of Federal State Budgetary Institution "Central Black Earth Bureau for and Environment Monitoring", Federal State Budgetary Research Institution "Belgorod Federal Agricultural Research Centre of Russian Research Academy", Federal State Budgetary Institution "Centre of Agrochemical Office", LLC "Centre of Ecological Provision and Expertise", the Department of Agro-Industrial Complex and Environment Rehabilitation of Belgorod region and other.

The teaching staff of the Institute of Earth Sciences takes an active part in implementing federal and regional projects. The research groups of the Institute conduct research work within the framework of the grants, supported by the Russian Research Foundation, Russian Foundation for Basic Research, Ministry of Science and Higher Education, Government of Belgorod Region, upon requests of organizations.

In 2018 the income of research and advanced development made up to 44,3 million rubles. In 2018 the Institute's teaching staff published over 120 research articles in top-rated editions from international citation index "Scopus" and "Web of Science".

The research group of the Institute of Earth Sciences as a part of the Research and Academic Centre of the international level "Innovation Solutions in Agro-Industrial Complex", which is implemented in BelSU, develops direction 10: "Development of geo-informational system for designing and implementing adaptive landscape systems of agriculture in Belgorod region" within Research and Production Enterprise 5: "Rational management of natural resources".

The students of the programmes under accreditation participate in international, national and regional conferences (Moscow, St. Petersburg, Kirov, Kazan, Kursk, Voronezh, Belgorod and other).

3. FINDINGS

3.1 Standard 1. Policy (goals, objectives, development strategy) and procedures of quality assurance

Compliance with the standard: ***Significant compliance***

Table 1 - Criteria for Standard 1

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability of a documented inner quality assurance system providing continuous enhancement of quality in accordance with the developmental strategy of the educational institution	A
2.	Participation of all stakeholders (administration, teaching staff, students, employers, employer associations, branch ministries and departments – key partners in employment of graduates) in developing and implementing a quality assurance policy through relevant structures and processes	B
3.	Participation of all structural units of an educational institution in quality assurance processes and procedures	B

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The University runs a successfully functioning unit – the Centre for quality management. The internal system of quality assurance is embodied in the system of BelSU's quality management, which includes the processes of 4 groups: management processes, processes of serPro and manufacturing, resourcing processes, processes of evaluation of results and improvement (approved on 06.09.2019). All the structural units of the University are involved in the implementation of these processes.

The review panel concluded that the internal quality assurance system is embodied in the Strategy of quality assurance of the Institute of Earth Sciences for 2019-2021 (approved by the minutes №10 of 18.06.2019), which includes the goal and objectives of the Strategy, implementation directions, and various events.

The review panel considers it necessary for the programmes to improve the awareness of the participants of the academic process, particularly students, teachers and employers of the goals and basic content of the Strategy of quality assurance of the Institute of Earth Sciences for 2019-2021 and the development strategy of the educational institution.

The University's quality management system was certified by the "Russian Register" Company group and the International Certification Network IQNet.

The meetings with the representatives of the Centre of quality management and the heads of the structural units proved that the improving of the academic process is ensured by conducting annual internal reviews of the system of quality management of the units and processes; annual adjustment of the documented information on the system of quality management in connection with its transition to international standard ISO 9001:2015, and teaching employees the modern methods of quality management of academic and research work.

The meetings with the University's authorities, representatives of the Centre of quality management, teaching staff and other groups proved that the development and implementation of quality assurance policy is multilevel. The results of the implementation of the quality assurance policy are analyzed by the Institute's management in the context of annual internal reviews. The Vice-rector's offices for quality and further training take part in determining the results of the quality assurance policy of the programmes under accreditation.

The review panel concludes that the participation of management, students, graduates and representatives of the professional community in designing and implementing the quality assurance policy is successfully provided by the procedures and mechanisms, which are included in the University's quality management system. However, it is recommended to involve more students and employers in the processes of designing the Institute's Development Strategy and improving the documents of the internal quality assurance system.

Achievements:

The University runs a successfully functioning unit – the Centre for quality management.

The University developed the quality assurance policy, which is the basis for the modern (standard ISO-9001.2015), well documented, internal quality assurance system of academic and research work.

The University's register of processes of the quality management system includes a full list of procedures, which are traditional for HEIs of the "National Research University" type.

The University's quality management system was certified by the "Russian Register" Company group and the International Certification Network IQNet.

The quality assurance of the programmes of the cluster under accreditation is provided by the implementation of "The strategy of quality assurance of training at BelSU's Institute of Earth Sciences for 2019-2021", which is designed according to "The Programme of enhancing competitive ability of BelSU among the world leading research and academic centres for 2013-2017 and 2020".

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to improve the awareness of the participants of the academic process (specifically students, teachers and employers) of the goals and main content of "The strategy of quality assurance of training at BelSU's Institute of Earth Sciences for 2019-2021" and the development strategy of the HEI.
2. It is advisable to involve more students, graduates and employers in the processes of designing and improving the documents of the internal quality assurance system.

3.2 Standard 2. Design and approval of programmes

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 2 – Criteria to Standard 2

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability and accessibility of clearly defined, documented, approved and published goals and objectives of a study programme and expected learning outcomes and their correspondence to the mission and goals and objectives of the educational institution	A
2.	Availability of procedures for design, approval and revision of a study programme (including expected learning outcomes) with the account of the development of science and industry, and also with the consideration of stakeholder opinions (administration, teaching staff, students, employers)	A
3.	Consideration of the requirements of professional standards (if available), of labour market, of national qualification framework descriptors in the study programme	A

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The review panel specifies that the programmes' goals and objectives are clearly determined and directly connected with the HEI's mission, implemented in compliance with "Development Programme of BelSU as a town-forming, research, social and educational, innovational and cultural center of Belgorod region for 2018-2022" and long-term development programmes of the region.

The educational programmes under accreditation comply with the Federal State Educational Standard for Higher Education.

The meetings with the teaching staff specified that the curricula are developed on the basis of the competency-based approach, achievement methods and requirements for learning outcomes.

The characteristics of the programmes and necessary documents are posted on the University's website - InfoBelGU: Educational process / Degree programs and are available for all the stakeholders.

The meetings with the students showed that the Institute uses electronic academic and methodological guidelines of the academic disciplines.

The Institute has formed a pool of experts, researchers and designers, which are involved in developing curricula and syllabi, updating and implementing educational programmes of higher education. The review panel recommends continuing working on the timely revision of the syllabi according to the achievements of modern science and technology in the field of geography, ecology and natural resource management.

The educational programmes of the Geography cluster account for the requirements of the national qualification framework descriptors (National Qualification Framework of the Russian Federation, project of 2012) for Bachelor and Master levels, which are determined in the Order of the Ministry of Labor of the Russian Federation of 12.04.2013 №148н "On the determination of qualification levels in order to developing projects of professional standards".

Representatives of professional community are actively involved in designing the programmes of the cluster under accreditation. The review panel recommends that the work on this issue should be continued.

Achievements:

The educational programmes comply with the legal requirements, are focused on the employers' needs and the demand for specialists in geography, ecology and natural resource management.

The goals and objectives are clearly determined and directly connected with the HEI's mission and long-term development programmes of the region.

Representatives of enterprises (LLC Research and Production Company "ECOTON", Federal State Budgetary Institution "Centre of Agrochemical Office Belgorodskiy"), representatives of the Department of Agro-Industrial Complex and Environment Rehabilitation of Belgorod region, the Department of Property and Land Relations of Belgorod region and others take part in updating the contents of the basic professional educational programmes.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to consider the opportunity of designing own educational standards with the account of the requirements of the National (project) and European qualification framework.
2. It is advisable to expand the scope of basic professional educational programmes, which are delivered in foreign languages.
3. It is recommended that the proportion of graduation theses, which are developed on commission of employers, should be increased.
4. It is advisable to update the programmes' contents upon the approval of new professional standards.

3.3 Standard 3. Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 3 – Criteria to Standard 3

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Consideration of needs of diverse groups of students and a possibility to create individual learning paths	A
2.	Use of methods encouraging students to take an active part in creating the learning process	A
3.	Use of clearly defined criteria and objective assessment procedures of learning outcomes/ competences of students corresponding to the expected learning outcomes, goals of the study programme and their purpose (diagnostic, formative or summative assessment)	A
4.	Information about the study programme, criteria and procedures for assessment of learning outcomes/competencies, about examinations, tests and other types of control.	A
5.	Use of procedures of independent assessment of learning outcomes	A
6.	Availability and effectiveness of appeals procedure and procedures for dealing with students complaints	A

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The order of evaluation of students' knowledge / competencies in formative and summative assessment and the state final attestation is provided by the documents, which are available on the official web-site and BelSU's electronic and informational educational environment.

In order to provide the effective cooperation of the participants of the educational process BelSU has implemented the electronic and informational educational environment, which includes access to the educational programmes, resources of electronic library, marks, portfolios and other. This allows the HEI to conduct monitoring the students' academic progress and achievements. The students are kept informed with the help of announcements, messages and explanations, which are posted on the Institute's web-site, during the preparation period.

Every student has a personal account, which grants access to methodological materials, academic progress, attendance, news, discussions, possibility to apply for e-learning (for determined categories of students only) and e-portfolio.

The students have the opportunity to design individual educational paths, acquire additional competencies in the system of further training.

The students' demands are taken into account in the process of organizing work placement. The students are assigned to relevant organizations not far from the place of residence.

After visiting classes and the meetings with students and teachers the review panel members became convinced that the methods, which stimulate students to actively participate in designing the academic process, are actively used.

The Students' Committee for promoting the improvement of educational quality in cooperation with HEIs structural units takes part in monitoring educational quality by way of conducting student surveys, questionnaires, tests and other. The students also participate in preparation and publication of methodological materials on evaluation of educational quality.

The University has all the conditions for acquiring knowledge, abilities and skills, conducting project and research work. The grade rating system provides flexibility and credibility in evaluation of the academic progress.

In order to use clear criteria and adequate procedures of evaluation of learning outcomes / competencies, which correspond to the expected learning outcomes, goals of the educational programme and mission (diagnostic, formative and summative assessment), the University runs the process of the quality management system "Design, development and implementation of educational programmes of higher education and their outcomes".

The system of educational quality control includes four aspects: admission control (diagnostic test); routine control of academic performance (formative assessment); intermediate attestation in every programme; control of retained knowledge (computer testing, developed by the University teachers).

The Master's programme graduates have experience of conducting experiments, measurements, information search and data analysis, as well as experience of presenting research results in reviewed scientific editions and at scientific events.

The work with students' and applicants' complaints is conducted according to the requirements of the documented procedure DP-4.5 "Unconformities and corrective actions". Overcoming contradictions, which appear in analytical and evaluative activities provided by a local regulation: Regulation on attestation and appeal committees in BelSU.

The appeal procedures are conducted within the framework of the final (state final) attestation.

Achievements:

The Institute of Earth Sciences has the system of work placement and training at the major departments and specialized enterprises;

The Institute of Earth Sciences annually participates in the procedures of independent review "Diagnostic e-test for the 1st-year students".

The students take part in the events of various levels: inter-HEI competitions, Olympiads, conferences of the International, National, regional and municipal levels, that provide the opportunity to evaluate the quality of training; actively participate in research projects.

The methodological provision of the academic process is at a high level.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to form partnership with students with the purpose of creating the student-centered educational environment.

3.4 Standard 4. Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 4 - Criteria to Standard 4

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Systematic carrier guidance work targeted at the recruiting and selection of applicants should be in place	A
2.	Availability and effectiveness of rules and regulations for admission, transfer of students from other educational institutions, recognition of qualifications, periods of study and prior learning	A
3.	Systematic work to support students' progression	A
4.	Recognition of higher education qualifications obtained in the RF and abroad (Diploma Supplement)	A
5.	Participation of students in mobility programmes	B

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The University conducts systematic career-guidance work, which is targeted at the selection of talented and motivated applicants: participation in the regional parades of professions, the University's offsite days (CIS and former Soviet Union countries), olympiads, excursions and counseling schoolchildren, joint Olympiads and competitions with the leading HEIs of Russia; research and creative events for students of educational institutions of the city and the region, which are conducted with the purpose of advertising.

BelSU's profession festivals, open-door days, preparation courses conducted by the University on a regular basis are very popular.

The University conducts admission e-programmes with the help of informational and educational portal within the framework of pre-University and career-guidance work with talented young people.

The results of career-guidance work have an effect on the outcomes of the admission campaign (annual increase of admitted applicants of the programmes).

The University's web-site, the section "For applicants" includes all the materials, which comprise rules and the order of admission, features of the delivered programmes (in the shape of a book of reference for applicants), content of entrance examinations, the process of admission, passing grades and other information.

The University conducts systematic work on assisting the students' academic progress and supporting academic achievements, particularly by way of filling the "Student's portfolio", which demonstrates the academic and other achievements of a student.

The University has created conditions for developing students' research works, which are carried out in association with research supervisors. The Students' Research Society promotes discovering research opportunities of BelSU's students.

The University's regulation, which is included in the Provision for organization and implementation of educational activity in higher education programmes – Bachelor, Specialist, Master programmes in BelSU determines the procedure of the transition of students from other educational institutions to BelSU.

The students, who completed the Bachelor's programme, continue studying the Master's programme 05.04.02 Geography (the Master's programme "Geo-ecology") and 05.04.06 Ecology and Natural Resources Management (Master's programme "Research of natural resources by means of airspace means"). Graduates of the Master's programmes have an opportunity to continue studying the post-graduate programme.

31 foreign students of 7 countries (Columbia, Ukraine, Uzbekistan, Tadzhikistan, Zambia, Chad, Congo) are studying at the Institute of Earth Sciences in 2019-2020 academic year.

In order to continue their studies abroad or search for employment in other countries, the University's students have an opportunity to acquire the Diploma Supplement. The supplements are given upon request.

The information and the programmes of international academic mobility are posted on the web-site of the University. However, the review panel recommends to improve the students' awareness of the mobility programmes.

Achievements:

In order to support students and young researchers the University has created the system of intra-HEI competitions: grant competition, theses competition, competition for an honorary title "Researcher student", "The winner in research work", "The best postgraduate of the year", competition in acquiring grants for creation and development of students' design bureaus;

The availability of the effective system of cooperation with the graduates and representatives of the professional community;

Regular participation of students in events of various levels, which allows to evaluate and encourage the quality of their training;

Availability of the Diploma Supplement and research internships in the leading national and international research institutions.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to improve cooperation with the leading international educational and research institutions, particularly, with the institutions working in the field of geography, ecology and natural resource

management, within the programmes of academic mobility and enhance the students' awareness of such programmes.

3.5 Standard 5. Teaching staff

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 5 - Criteria to Standard 5

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Qualification and competence of the teaching staff : – Academic degrees and titles; – Industry and state awards and prizes; – Practical experience; – Published text books, handbooks and methodological guidebooks	A
2.	Relevance of specialists, degrees and titles and /or practical experience to the profile of the study programme	A
3.	Research activity of the teaching staff, implementation of research results in the academic process	A
4.	Use of innovative teaching methods and advanced technologies	B
5.	Visiting lecturers from other educational institutions including those from abroad	B
6.	Participation of the teachers in joint international projects, internships abroad, academic mobility programmes	B
7.	A system of financial and non-financial incentives for teachers	A
8.	Availability and use of clear, transparent and objective criteria for: – Hiring staff including teachers from foreign educational institutions, assignment to positions, promotion, dismissal; – Dismissal of teachers with low level of professional competency	A
9.	A system for career development and professional advancement for teachers	A

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The basic education and the level of qualification of the teaching staff of the programmes "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06) comply with the determined requirements.

A highly-qualified teaching staff is involved in the process of implementing the educational programmes. The Department of Geography, Geo-ecology and Life Safety includes 18 teachers: 2 (11%) Doctors of Sciences, 13 (72%) Candidates of Sciences, 3 (16.6%) have a huge practical experience in institutions of geographical and geo-ecological focus.

The Department of Nature Management and Land Cadastre includes 22 teachers: 5 (23%) Doctors of Sciences, 12 (54.5%) Candidates of Sciences, 8 (36.4%) have extensive practical experience in organizations and institutions of the corresponding profile.

The emplementation of the degree programs involves employees of two basic departments of the institute: the Department of Land Management (the Federal State Budgetary Research Institution "Belgorod Federal Agricultural

Research Centre of Russian Research Academy") and the Department of Agroecology (the Federal State Budgetary Institution "Centre of Agrochemical Office") and the Federal and Regional Centre of Aerospace and Earth-based Monitoring of Objects and Natural Resources.

Many teachers are holders of industry awards, national awards, honorary titles and other.

Over the past 5 years the teachers of the programme "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02) have published 325 research papers: in Higher Attestation Commission journals – 30; in Scopus, Web of Science – 32; in Russian Science Citation Index journals – 70, in the materials of research conferences – 57 articles. Over 10 intellectual property objects were registered.

The teachers involved in implementing the programme "Environmental studies and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06) have published 450 research papers over the past 5 years, and registered more than 20 intellectual property objects.

The academic process includes various educational technologies and forms of training: technologies of processing information of the participants of the study process; technology of information search; technology of working with academic literature; technology of accumulation and systematization of information (portfolio); technology of organizing content-analysis; technology of organizing independent work; technology of improving communicative competency; expertise and evaluation technologies; active and interactive forms of conducting lectures and practical courses (teleconferences, computer simulation, business and role-playing games, analysis of specific cases, e-testing) in combination with extracurricular work with the purpose of forming and developing professional skills in compliance with the Federal State Educational Standard of the Russian Federation.

E-communication and network resources are actively used for preparation and evaluation of the tasks. Electronic academic and methodological sets of the academic disciplines are developed and used.

The University annually invites leading national and international specialists for students of the cluster under accreditation.

The powerful research and innovation infrastructure of the Institute provides opportunities for conducting research of the world level and achieve significant results of the national and international level: in 2011-2014 the implementation of the projects of the RFBR foundation No. 11-05-92500-AFGIR-E_a; in 2014-2015 as a part of Fulbright Programme the leading American researcher in the field of climatology and atmospheric physics, professor of the University of Missouri A.R. Lupo was invited to the Department; in 2019 the development of the informational resource Eurasian Kurgan Database in cooperation with Hungarian researchers.

Interdisciplinary issues of geo-archeology are researched in cooperation with the Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences and Humanities (Germany). The Institute in cooperation with the US scientists conducts research "Climatic changes in eastern European forest steppe and their influence on common pine's productivity".

The teaching staff has the opportunity of participating in international externships, for example, Professor of the Department of Natural Resources and Land Cadastre Chendev Y.G. worked in the University of Missouri (Columbia, USA), the Department of Soil, Atmosphere and Environmental

Sciences within the framework of the programmes "Technologies for the Study and Use of Natural Resources" and "The Protection and Rational Use of Natural Resources and Subsoil in the Practice of Education, Recreation and Production Activities USA".

The University maintains an effective policy, which is targeted at promoting scientific achievements and encouraging the improvement of further education of the teaching staff.

The system includes such means of material and non-material incentives as the system of encouraging research and innovation development of the rating evaluation system of the teaching staff and structural units; bonus payments; special awards; social protection for the University's employees.

The procedure of employing and promoting teachers is documented and based on the system of competitive selection.

All the teachers of the programme regularly undergo further education and training in BelSU and other leading research and academic institutions of the Russian Federation. The supporting documents are available on the University's web-site.

Achievements:

The high potential of the teaching stuff provides an opportunity to conduct research and project activity at the highest level.

The research group of the Institute of Earth Sciences as a part of the Research and Academic Centre of the world level "Innovational Solutions in Agro-Industrial Complex", which is implemented in BelSU, develops direction 10: "Development of geo-informational system for designing and implementing adaptive landscape systems of agriculture in Belgorod region" within Research and Production Enterprise 5: "Rational management of natural resources".

The teachers' high performance activity in research projects, which results in publications. Over the past 5 years the teachers of the programme "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02) have published 325 research papers: in Higher Attestation Commission journals – 30; in Scopus, Web of Science – 32; in Russian Science Citation Index journals – 70, in the materials of research conferences – 57 articles. The teachers involved in implementing the programme "Environmental studies and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06) have published 450 research works over the past 5 years.

Over 10 intellectual property objects were registered in the field of study "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02) and more than 20 intellectual property objects in the field of study "Environmental studies and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06) .

Heavy authority of the Institute's teaching staff as independent experts at the regional and national levels.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to improve the language competencies of the teaching staff in order to enhance involvement in the programmes of academic mobility.
2. It is advisable to improve implementing the outcomes of research work of the teaching staff in innovational teaching methods and technologies (cases, projects, interactive and problem-based teaching).

3. It is recommended to increase the share of the participation of teachers from other educational institutions (particularly foreign institutions) up to 15% of the total scope of the programmes' content.

4. It is advisable to improve the teachers' cooperation with the professional community with the purpose of developing courses on the basis of professional standards.

5. It is recommended to work out the road-map for increasing the quantity of teachers, who undertake internships and exchange programmes.

6. It is advisable to promote creating of the Thesis Committee on Earth Sciences and including the journal "Scientific Bulletin of Belgorod State University" (series: Natural sciences) into international databases of Scopus and Web of Science.

3.6 Standard 6. Learning resources and student support

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 6 - Criteria to Standard 6

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Provision of the study programme with material and technical recourses in accordance with the requirements of the curriculum (modern tools, equipment, computers, classrooms, laboratories)	B
2.	Availability of up-to-date library and information resources including those for independent study and research work	A
3.	Availability of infrastructure to ensure access to quality education to students with different opportunities and of different age, and to provide the development of social and educational component of the academic process	A
4.	The system of feedback on the satisfaction with conditions and organization of the study process should be in place	A
5.	Availability of accessible information about opportunities for student mobility and its support system	B

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The University provides sufficient material resources for implementing the programmes "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06). The resources provide an opportunity for conducting all kinds of disciplinary and inter-disciplinary training, laboratory, practical and research work.

The review panel had the opportunity to visit classooms and laboratories of the Institute, which are provided with modern equipment: laboratory of cartography; landscape geochemical laboratory; laboratory of environmental diagnostics and monitoring studies; laboratory of regional geo-ecological research; eco-analysis laboratory; GIS technology laboratory; geodesy laboratory with the basics of cartography; geodesy laboratory with the basics of cartography and mining and geological information system GIS GEOMIX and other.

The University's research centres are used for conducting classes and research work of Bachelor and Master students. The laboratories are provided with the equipment, which comply with the world and national standards:

Central Control of "Federal and Regional Centre of Aerospace and Earth-based Monitoring of Objects and Natural Resources", "Petin Geological and Mineralogical Museum", academic centre "BelSU's Botanical garden" and other.

The implementation of the programmes is carried out with the assistance of material and technical resources of the Institute's 2 major departments: the Department of Natural Resources Management of the Federal State Budgetary Research Institution "Belgorod Federal Agrarian Research Centre of the Russian Academy of Science"; the department of agro-ecology of the Federal State Budgetary Institution "Centre of Agrochemical Office".

In order to make electronic publications available to the students' independent study, all the students are provided with working space at the computer laboratories with the access to the Internet.

The stock of the research library includes 1,084,621 copies of documents: 47% - educational literature, 10% - educational and methodological literature, 39% - scientific editions, 4% - fiction literature. The electronic library includes over 83 thousand full-text documents.

In 2019, the National Research University "BelSU" was granted access to 40 national and foreign databases: Oxford Journals Online; Nature and Science; Questel; Springer; Web of Science; Scopus.

The University has developed a targeted program "Accessible Environment at the National Research University" BelSU ". The program is implemented in the following areas: career guidance, adaptation of the educational process, social and cultural adaptation, psychological support for students with disabilities, creation of architectural accessibility.

Numerous sport clubs are available for the University's students.

The evaluation of the conditions and organization of the study process is directly connected with the feedback system, and based on systematic (annual) monitoring of students' contentment with the quality of training. The system also includes internal control of organizational quality and classes, internal reviews of structural units, meetings with students, activity of students' noncommercial organizations.

The HEI has informational e-environment, electronic library. The Institute plans to implement a unified electronic security system by way of using bank plastic cards (electronic students' grade books, electronic library account, electronic pass).

The University's infrastructure, which provides availability of quality training for students with different abilities and educational requirements: organization and informational support of the study process, educational and social and cultural activity, career support, medical care, sports and fitness work, organization of living conditions, catering.

The University houses the Students' Committee for promoting improvement of educational quality.

The HEI has formed a wide partner network of international cooperation. The University is included in the list of basic HEIs of Shanghai Cooperation Organization.

Achievements:

Contemporary informational and communicational library technologies and electronic library system.

Modern material and technical resources for research work. In order to conduct classes and research work the programmes use the University's

research centres, which are provided with the equipment, which comply with world and national standards: Central Control of "Federal and Regional Centre of Aerospace and Earth-based Monitoring of Objects and Natural Resources", "Petin Geological and Mineralogical Museum", academic centre "BelSU's Botanical garden" and other.

A wide system of feedback from all the stakeholders.

The academic process is provided with necessary methodological documents. The HEI has access to 40 national and foreign databases.

The organization of the management of the academic process is at a high level, which provides the opportunity to conduct effective training of the cluster under accreditation.

The University has developed a targeted program "Accessible Environment at the National Research University" BelSU ".

The University is included in the list of basic HEIs of Shanghai Cooperation Organization, which provides the opportunity to study at the Universities of China, Kazakhstan, Kirghizia, Tadzhikistan.

Recommendations:

1. In order to improve the quality of academic work, it is recommended to use modern equipment of partner-HEIs more actively and enhance the level of academic mobility of the teaching staff and students.

3.7 Standard 7. Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the educational institution

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 7 - Criteria to Standard 7

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Availability and effectiveness of the system for collecting and monitoring information about the study programme	A
2.	Participation of students and staff of the educational institution in collecting and analyzing information for managing the study programme	B
3.	The educational institution should have in place a unified effective information system on the basis of modern information technologies for managing the study programme	A

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The information posted on the University's web-site is open and available. The informational content of the web-site is continuously updated according to the requirements of the Federal Education and Science Supervision SerPro, which are determined in order №785 of May 29, 2014 "On Approving the Requirements for the Structure of the Official Website of an Educational Organization in the Information and Telecommunication Network "Internet" and the Format for Presenting Information".

The collection and analysis of information are carried out by way of questionnaires and exchange of opinions among students, teachers and employers. The monitoring of students' and teachers' opinions provides an

opportunity to determine their satisfaction with the conditions of study and work.

The HEI has an informational intranet, which provides access to news, time-table, and academic materials for students and teachers.

The electronic informational and educational environment is available for the teaching staff and students. The review panel members were acquainted with the opportunities of the educational portal and resources of the e-environment.

The awareness of the students and the academic staff of the educational programme and implementation conditions is organized through the news feed on the official web-site, printed editions, notifications, discussion of the current situation at department meetings, the Academic Councils of the Faculty, the Academic Council of the University, meetings of the executive staff.

The teachers and students are actively involved in collecting and analyzing information through the annual monitoring of the satisfaction of the consumers of educational serPros. The collection of the necessary information is carried out via e-learning system "Pegasus", students' and teachers' personal accounts, rating system, email and personal communication of the departments' heads with teachers; teachers' reports on accomplishment of the individual plans or instructions.

Achievements:

The University has an informational system, which includes methodological materials, educational programmes, manuals and regulations on their revision and replenishment.

All the information on the educational programmes is available on the University's web-site.

The collection and monitoring of the necessary information is carried out via e-learning system "Pegasus".

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to improve feedback between students and the Institute's executive staff by way of keeping students informed on the results of the feedback.
2. It is advisable to conduct a comparative analysis of the achievements of the programmes under accreditation with similar programmes, which are implemented in foreign Universities.

3.8 Standard 8. Public information

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 8 - Criteria to Standard 8

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Effective use of the official website of the study programme for its quality enhancement	A
2.	Publication of complete and accurate information on the study programme and its achievements on the official website of the educational institution and mass media	A
3.	Publication of objective data on the employability of graduates	B
4.	Integration in the environment, interaction of the educational institution with different professional associations and other organization including those from abroad	A

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

Information on the educational programmes is posted on the Institute's web-site (features of the programme, study plan, abstracts of the academic disciplines, information on internships, study time-tables, study calendar schedule, information on the teaching staff and other). It is regularly updated and available for all the stakeholders. The web-site has the version for visually impaired persons.

The public is kept informed on the educational programmes through various social networks, mass media, and interaction with professional community.

The activity of the basic departments on public information is directed to coordinating and covering the work by mass media, creating a positivepublic image. The main evaluation means are questionnaires; interviews; analysis of publications, reports, opinions; public meetings; presentations; opinions of governmental and non-governmental bodies and other.

The University develops corporative informational resources: newspaper ("News of BelSU" is registered as a regional informational and educational newspaper), web-site (www.bsu.edu.ru, (БЕЛГУ.РФ) is registered as an electronic mass media), students' radio station ("Beliy Gus" – internal broadcasting), television ("Tvoyo Universitetskoe Televidenie", student department of "Restart TV" internal broadcasting on the University's web-site and YouTube channel). The newspaper is published monthly on 8 pages. Information, which is posted on the web-site, is updated daily. The radio and TV stations broadcast two times a week.

The University has the Centre of Professional Career. Its purpose is to support employability, career guidance and social adaptation of students of the University. The official web-site includes special section "Employment".

The Association of the University's Graduates assists students in employment with the support of the HEI's graduates.

The information on opportunities of employment of students (graduate students) and vacancies for graduates are collected and analyzed.

Within the framework of cooperation with companies and organizations, BelSU signed partnership agreements with a number of enterprises: Federal

State Budgetary Research Institution "Belgorod Federal Agrarian Research Centre of the Russian Academy of Science", Department of Preservation and Utilization of Fauna, Water Biological Resources and Their Life Environment of Belgorod Region; Federal State Budgetary Institution "Federal Cadastre Chamber", the company group "EFKO", State Natural Reserve "Belogorye" and other.

Achievements:

Information on the educational programmes is posted on the University's / Institute's web site is regularly updated and available for all interested parties.

Availability of information resources: "Portal of Open Education" – a modern educational platform, which provides on-line courses in basic academic disciplines; "Talents of BelSU" – a resource of interaction with talented schoolchildren and young people; the University's Centre of Professional Career, students' radio station, "Tvoyo Universitetskoe Televidenie" and other.

The University's department for public relations and mass media is the winner of the contest "Press office of the HEI - 2018", took the 2nd place in nomination "Info-leader". The University Rector is included in TOP-50 media-active Rectors of the Russian Federation.

The Students' Media-Holding incorporates all University mass media, newspapers, television and radio.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to continue working on filling the English version of the web-site, which is expected to duplicate the structure and content of the Russian language version.
2. It is advisable to ensure regular update of information on the employment and employability of the graduates in the web-site section "Employment".
3. It is recommended to enlarge the specter of marketing research on the regional labor market.
4. It is advisable to provide more active posting of the HEI's achievements with the purpose of promoting educational programmes in Russia and abroad.

3.9 Standard 9. On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 9 – Criteria to Standard 9

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Documented procedures of monitoring and periodic review of study programmes should be in place	A
2.	Availability of a feedback mechanism for students, employers, branch ministries and departments (key stakeholders in employment) in the process of monitoring and periodic review of a study programme	A
3.	Effectiveness of procedures for monitoring and periodic review of a study programme (enhancement of programmes)	B

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The procedures for monitoring and periodic evaluation and review of the study programmes are specified by the local document "Provision for development and approval of basic professional educational programmes".

The feedback mechanism includes questionnaires, work meetings with employers, discussions of the programmes at industry meetings. Students, representatives of employers, employment key-partners are involved in evaluation of the programmes' quality. However, it is recommended to improve and continue working on coordination of educational programmes with professional associations of employers.

The review panel noted the effectiveness of the procedures for monitoring and periodic reviewing of the programmes, which include: the system of measures of managing educational quality control, which has several levels; the department level – the work of quality committees; the level of Institute Director's office – internal reviews within the framework of the documented procedure "Internal reviews in educational departments of BelSU"; the level of the Vice-Rector for quality and further training; according to the results of internal reviews, specifically thematic reviews, which are conducted upon Rectors orders; the level of the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs; at the meetings of the Academic and Methodological Council of the University; the University's level; at the meetings of the Small and Extended Rector's office, the University's Academic Council.

The educational programmes and their components are systematically updated (components of disciplines (modules), which are determined by the HEI, and (or) content of working programmes of the courses, subjects, disciplines, programmes of academic and industrial internships, methodological materials, which provide the implementation of educational technology) and published in the automated system "InfoBelSU: Academic process".

The effectiveness of monitoring and evaluating procedures is proved by a steady demand for the educational programmes among applicants and requests for employer-sponsored training.

Achievements:

The HEI developed an effective mechanism of cooperation with employers (the Department of Preservation and Utilization of Fauna, Water

Biological Resources and Their Life Environment of Belgorod Region; Federal State Budgetary Institution "Federal Cadastre Chamber", the company group "EFKO", State Natural Reserve "Belogorye" and other), which creates conditions for involvement of employers in monitoring and evaluating the educational programmes.

The annual monitoring of consumers' satisfaction and collecting information on stakeholders' opinions show the positive dynamics of the delivered educational programmes.

The availability of the documents, which determine the procedures of monitoring the effectiveness of work on implementing the educational programmes.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to effectively use the latest achievements of science in the context of revision of the programmes' content.
2. It is advisable to improve the mechanisms of feedback from students, employers, profile ministries and offices (the key partners in employment) in the process of monitoring and periodic evaluating of the educational programmes.

3.10 Standard 10. Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes

Compliance with the standard: ***Full compliance***

Table 10 - Criteria to Standard 10

№	Subject of Evaluation	Mark
1.	Periodic review of a study programme	A
2.	Availability of a corrective actions programme to follow up the results of external evaluation of study programmes	A
3.	Consideration of the results of previous procedures of external evaluation when conducting subsequent external procedures	A

Analysis of the cluster of educational programmes' compliance with the standard:

The University takes part in the procedures of external quality assurance of basic educational programmes of higher education: annual monitoring of the HEI's efficiency, self-examination, state accreditation, public accreditation.

In 2015, the educational programmes under accreditation, which are included in the extended group of professions, specialties and areas of professional education "Earth Sciences" were submitted for state accreditation. According to the results of the state examination, the content and quality of training of students of the educational programs under accreditation conform with the Federal State Educational Standards; on April 7, 2016, it was included in Annex 1 to the Certificate of State Accreditation, valid until April 10, 2021.

The continuous external quality assurance procedures for the degree programs involve the annual monitoring of the performance of the Belgorod State University and the Institute of Earth Sciences in the form of a self-assessment report for the past academic year (approved by the Academic Council of the Institute of Earth Sciences 25.09.2019, minutes No. 1). Self-

examination was performed as a part of the collection of information in the process of monitoring the effectiveness of educational institutions of higher education in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Russia dated March 22, 2018 No. 204.

The review panel notes the follow-up activity based on the results of the external review and received recommendations, which is specified in the nonconformance reports (if nonconformities are discovered), in plans and reports of follow-up and prevention actions, plans of quality assurance, road maps and other.

The results of the implementation of the educational programmes, specifically, the results of preceding external evaluation, are annually estimated and analyzed by the executive staff under the agreed criteria and compared with the results of other HEIs.

The structural components of self-evaluation in the area of educational work are: organization of career guidance work, structure and content of training at all levels of education (contingent dynamics, the range of the implemented study programs); methodological, library and informational provision of the programmes; organization of the educational process, which includes practice-oriented training; quality of training (quality of knowledge at the level of formative and summative assessment; employment and employability of graduates; internal and external systems for assessing the quality of education; staffing of the educational process (quality of academic staff, organization of further training).

In order to compare the best achievements of other HEIs, the University periodically analyses the rating of national HEIs and specialties, which is compiled by the Federal Agency for Education.

The review panel supports the Institute's initiative of participating in the procedures of self-evaluation and recommends implementing regular procedures of public / international accreditation of educational programmes with the purpose of promoting the programmes in Russia and abroad.

Achievements:

Regular participation in the procedures of external quality assurance of different forms (state accreditation, monitoring of efficiency, external reviews of the quality management system and other) at the levels of the University, Institute and educational programmes.

Availability of the feedback system with the purpose of designing follow-up actions on the basis of external evaluation of educational programmes;

Publication of external evaluation results of educational programmes on the official web-site of the University.

Recommendations:

1. It is recommended to develop quantitative criteria and indexes for complete account of recommendations of the preceding reviews.
2. It is advisable to develop and execute new possibilities, which were acquired after the last procedure of external quality assurance with the purpose of improving the internal processes of quality assurance.
3. It is recommended to use objective information, which was acquired in the process of external quality assurance, to keep the public aware of the quality of the Institute of Earth Sciences and educational programmes.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT

Thus, based on the analysis of the presented documents, meetings and interviews, conducted during the site-visit, with the purpose of enhancing the quality of implementing the educational programmes under accreditation the Review Panel recommends the following:

1. It is recommended to improve the awareness of the participants of academic process (specifically students, teachers and employers) of the goals and main content of "The strategy of quality assurance of training at BelSU's Institute of Earth Sciences for 2019-2021" and the development strategy of the HEI.
2. It is advisable to involve more students, graduates and employers in the processes of designing and improving documents of the internal quality assurance system.
3. It is recommended to consider the opportunity of designing own educational standards with the account of the requirements of the National (project) and European qualification framework.
4. It is advisable to expand the scope of basic professional educational programmes, which are conducted in foreign languages.
5. It is recommended that the proportion of graduation theses, which are developed on commission of employers, should be increased.
6. It is recommended to improve cooperation with the leading international educational and research institutions, particularly with the institutions, which work in the field of geography, ecology and natural resource management within the programmes of academic mobility and enhance the students' awareness of such programmes.
7. It is recommended to improve language competencies of the teaching staff in order to enhance involvement in the programmes of academic mobility.
8. It is advisable to improve implementing research work of the teaching staff in innovational teaching methods and technologies (cases, projects, interactive and problem-based teaching).
9. It is advisable to improve teachers' cooperation with the professional community with the purpose of developing courses on the basis of professional standards
10. It is recommended to work out the road-map for increasing the number of teachers, who undertake internships and exchange programmes; to increase the share of participation of teachers from other educational institutions including foreign institutions.
11. It is advisable to promote creating of the Thesis Committee on Earth Sciences and including the journal "Scientific Bulletin of Belgorod State University" (series: Natural sciences) into international databases of Scopus and Web of Science.
12. It is recommended to continue working on designing the English version of the web-site, which is expected to duplicate the structure and contents of the Russian language version.
13. It is recommended to improve feedback between students and the Institute's executive staff by way of keeping students informed on the results of the feedback.

14. It is advisable to ensure regular update of information on the employment and employability of the graduates in the web-site section "Employment".

15. It is advisable to improve mechanisms of feedback from students, employers, profile ministries and offices (the key partners in employment) in the process of monitoring and periodic evaluating the educational programme.

16. It is recommended to develop quantitative criteria and indexes for the complete account of recommendations of preceding reviews.

17. It is advisable to provide more active posting of the HEI's achievements with the purpose of promoting educational programmes in Russia and abroad.

5. CONCLUSION

Based on the self-evaluation report analysis, documents and data submitted the External Review Panel has come to the conclusion that the cluster of educational programmes in "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06) **fully** complies with the standards and criteria of public accreditation of the National Centre for Public Accreditation.

The Panel recommends that the National Accreditation Board accredit the cluster of educational programmes in "Geography" (05.03.02, 05.04.02), "Ecology and natural resources management" (05.03.06, 05.04.06), delivered by the Federal State Autonomous Educational Institution of Higher Education "Belgorod State National Research University", for the period of **6** years.

ANNEX A

SCHEDULE OF THE SITE VISIT OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW PANEL

Time	Activity	Participants	Venue
December 3, Tuesday			
8.30	Transfer from the hotel (30, Nikolaia Chumichova Str.) to the University		
09.00 — 11.00	First meeting of the External Review Panel		Room 2-22 (15 Building), Centre of Civic and National Education: 85, Pobedy Str.
11.00 — 12.00	**Meeting of the ERP with the University administration and people responsible for accreditation**	Rector, Pro-Rectors, people responsible for accreditation, ERP	Room 2-22 (15 Building), Centre of Civic and National Education: 85, Pobedy Str.
12.00 — 13.00	Tour of the University (visiting classrooms, library, etc.)	ERP	85, Pobedy Str.
13.00 — 14.00	Lunch		Dining Room
14.00 — 14.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)
14.30 — 15.30	**Meeting with Institute Director, Dean of the Faculty, representatives of the Quality Centre**	Institute Director, Deputy Directors, ERP	Room 2.7 (14 Building)
15.30 — 16.00	Work with documents	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)
16.00 — 17.00	**Meeting with Heads of Departments**	Heads of Departments, ERP	Room 2.7 (14 Building)
17.00 — 17.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)
17.30 — 18.30	**Meeting with graduates**	Graduates, ERP	Room 2.7 (14 Building)
18.30 — 18.45	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)
December 4, Wednesday			
9.30	Transfer from the hotel (30, Nikolaia Chumichova Str.) to the University		
10.00 — 11.00	**Meeting with teachers**	Teachers, ERP	Room 2.7 (14 Building)
11.00 — 11.30	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)
11.30 — 12.30	**Meeting with students**	Students, ERP	Room 2.7 (14 Building)
12.30 — 13.00	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)
13.00 — 14.00	Lunch		Dining Room
14.30 — 16.30	Work with documents / attending classes (optional)	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)

16.30 — 17.30	**Meeting with representatives of professional community**	Employers, ERP	Room 2.7 (14 Building)
17.30 — 18.00	Internal meeting of the Panel	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)
December 5, Thursday			
8.45	Transfer from the hotel (30, Nikolaia Chumichova Str.) to the University		
09.00 — 12.00	Internal meeting of the Panel: discussion of preliminary results of the site visit, preparation of the oral report of the panel	ERP	Room 2.18 (14 Building)
12.00 — 13.00	**Closing meeting of the External Review Panel with the representatives of the University**	ERP, Institute administration, Heads of Departments, teachers, students	Room 2-22 (15 Building), Centre of Civic and National Education: 85, Pobedy Str.
13.30 — 14.00	Lunch		
	Departure		

ANNEX C

THE SCALE OF ASSESSMENT PARAMETERS OF A STUDY PROGRAMME

№	Standards	Marks			
		Full compliance	Substantial compliance	Partial compliance)	Incompliance
1.	Policy (goals, development strategy) and quality assurance procedures of a study programme		*		
2.	Design and approval of programmes	*			
3.	Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment	*			
4.	Student admission, support of academic achievements and graduation	*			
5.	Teaching staff	*			
6.	Learning resources and student support	*			
7.	Collection, analysis and use of information for managing the study programme	*			
8.	Public information	*			
9.	On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes	*			
10.	Cyclical external quality assurance of study programmes	*			