

RESOLUTION OF THE NATIONAL ACCREDITATION BOARD MEETING

December 20, 2024

Form of the meeting: online and offline.

Venue: Moscow P.I. Tchaikovsky State Conservatory, Bolshaya Nikitskaya Str. 13/6, Moscow, 125009, Russian Federation.

Devices for online participation in the meeting: <https://teams.microsoft.com/> - a programme to organize videoconferences

Start time: 14.00.

End time: 16.30.

The overall number of Board members: 27

The meeting **was attended** by 20 members of the National Accreditation Board: I. Arzhanova, V. Bolotov, S. Golubenko, D. Grichuk, M. Gusev, I. Dokuchaev, E. Zima, S. Karakozov, A. Komov, I. Kuksa, I. Muradova, N. Nikitina, G. Perfilieva, V. Ponka, V. Filippov, O. Tsapko, A. Chaplygin, A. Epshtein, E. Esentaev, S. Yankevich.

A quorum is present. The National Accreditation Board is eligible to make decisions on all issues of the agenda.

A person, who counts votes: Galina Motova, Academic Secretary.

Invited experts:

A. Atabekova, I. Borisova, D. Vinokhodov, S. Vishiakov, L. Dzhumanova, I. Dmitrienko (Kyrgyzstan), Y. Karpov, N. Loginova, V. Lodnya. (Belarus), G. Narimanova, E. Radaeva, G. Paputkova, M. Skiba (Kazakhstan), A. Sokolov, S. Sydykova (Kazakhstan), N. Tarasevich, T. Shindina.

AGENDA:

1. NCPA's progress in the second half of 2024
2. The results of the international external review of clusters of educational programmes (conducted jointly with Bilim-Standard, Kyrgyzstan) delivered by:
 - Kyrgyz National University named after J.Balasagyn;
3. The results of the international external review of clusters of educational programmes delivered by:
 - Northern (Arctic) Federal University named after M.V. Lomonosov;
 - Belgorod State National Research University;
 - National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod;
 - National Research University «Moscow Power Engineering Institute»;
 - Krasnodar State Institute of Culture;
 - Chelyabinsk State Institute of Culture and Arts;
 - Moscow P.I. Tchaikovsky State Conservatory;
 - Novosibirsk State Agricultural University;
 - Ufa State Petroleum Technological University;
 - Minin Nizhny Novgorod State Pedagogical University.
4. The results of the international external review of clusters of educational programmes (Top accreditation):
 - Peter the Great St.Petersburg Polytechnic University;
 - Kazan State Medical University;
 - Gnesin Russian Academy of Music.
5. The results of the international external review of a cluster of further education programmes:
 - Federal Institute of Industrial Property.
6. The results of the national external review of clusters of educational programmes:
 - Saint Petersburg Institute of Culture;
 - Birsk branch of Ufa University of Science and Technology.
7. Other issues.

1. The first issue of the agenda was presented by **G. Motova «NCPA's progress in the second half of 2024»**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved: to take the information into consideration.

2. The second issue of the agenda was presented by **G. Motova on the results of the international external review of clusters of educational programmes conducted jointly with:**

Bilim-Standard (Kyrgyzstan)

- **Kyrgyz National University named after J.Balasagyn**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Jurisprudence» (530500) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit a postgraduate study programme in «Jurisprudence» (530500) (PhD) for the period of 6 years.
- 3) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Pedagogy» (550700) for the period of 6 years.
- 4) To accredit a postgraduate study programme in «Pedagogy» (550700) (PhD) for the period of 6 years.
- 5) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Psychology» (530300), «Clinical Psychology» (530001) for the period of 6 years.
- 6) To accredit a postgraduate study programme in «Philosophy» (530100) (PhD) for the period of 6 years.
- 7) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Linguistics» (531100) for the period of 6 years.
- 8) To accredit a postgraduate study programme in «Linguistics» (531100) (PhD) for the period of 6 years.
- 9) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Journalism» (530600), «Television» (571100) for the period of 6 years.
- 10) To accredit a postgraduate study programme in «Journalism» (530600) (PhD) for the period of 6 years.
- 11) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «History» (530400), «Area Studies» (531600) for the period of 6 years.
- 12) To accredit a postgraduate study programme in «History» (530400) (PhD) for the period of 6 years.
- 13) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Software Engineering» (710400), «Information Systems and Technologies» (710200), «Information

Technologies» (510300), «Information Security» (590100), «Business Informatics» (580500), «Computer Science and Informatics» (710100) for the period of 6 years.

14) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Management» (580200), «Marketing» (581000), «Business Administration» (580700), «MBA» (Ind.) for the period of 6 years.

15) To accredit a postgraduate study programme in «Management» (580200) (PhD) for the period of 6 years.

16) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics» (580100), «State and Municipal Administration» (580900), «Economics and Management» (Ind.) for the period of 6 years.

17) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «International Relations» (530800), «Oriental Studies, African Studies» (530900) for the period of 6 years.

18) To accredit Kyrgyz National University named after J.Balasagyn for the period of 6 years.

3. The third issue of the agenda was presented by **G. Motova** on the results of the international external review of clusters of educational programmes delivered by:

– **Northern (Arctic) Federal University named after M.V. Lomonosov**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in подготовки «Economics» (38.03.01, 38.04.01), «Management» (38.03.02, 38.04.02), «State and Municipal Administration» (38.03.04, 38.04.04) for the period of 6 years.

– **Belgorod State National Research University**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Biology» (06.03.01, 06.04.01) for the period of 6 years.

– **National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhny Novgorod**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Political Science» (41.03.04, 41.04.04), «History» (46.03.01, 46.04.01) for the period of 6 years.
 - 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Law» (40.03.01, 40.04.01), «Legal Support for National Security» (40.05.01), «Forensics» (40.05.03) for the period of 6 years.
- **National Research University «Moscow Power Engineering Institute»**
Questions were asked.
Votes:
«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.
Unanimously.
Following the voting results it is resolved:
- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Informatics and Computer Engineering» (09.03.01, 09.04.01), «Applied Informatics» (09.03.03, 09.04.03), «Information Security» (10.03.01, 10.04.01) for the period of 6 years.
- **Krasnodar State Institute of Culture**
Questions were asked.
Votes:
«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.
Unanimously.
Following the voting results it is resolved:
- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Art of Instrumental Music Performance» (53.03.02), «Jazz and Popular Music Performance» (53.03.01), «Musicology and Musical Applied Arts» (53.04.06) for the period of 6 years.
- **Chelyabinsk State Institute of Culture and Arts**
Questions were asked.
Votes:
«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.
Unanimously.
Following the voting results it is resolved:
- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Variety Music Art» (53.03.01), «Musical Instrumental Art» (53.03.02), «Folk Singing Art» (53.03.04), «Conducting» (53.03.05), «Musicology and Musical Applied Art» (53.03.06, 53.04.06), «Concert Performance Art» (53.05.01), «Artistic Leadership of an Opera-Symphony Orchestra and an Academic Choir» (53.05.02), «Musical Theatrical Art» (53.05.04) for the period of 6 years.
 - 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Art of Musical-Instrumental Performance (in different kinds)» (53.09.01) for the period of 6 years.

– **Moscow P.I. Tchaikovsky State Conservatory**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Art of Concert Performance» (53.05.01), «Artistic Leadership of Opera-Symphony Orchestra and Academic Chorus» (53.05.02), «Musical performing art» (53.05.04), «Music studies» (53.05.05), «Composition» (53.05.06) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Theory and History of Culture, Art» (5.10.1.), «Study of Art» (5.10.3.), «Art of Musical Instrument Performance» (53.09.01), «Art of Vocal Performance» (53.09.02), «Art of Composition» (53.09.03), «Mastership of Musical Sound Engineering» (53.09.04), «Art of Conducting» (53.09.05) for the period of 6 years.

– **Novosibirsk State Agricultural University**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Technology of Transport Processes» (23.03.01), «Technical Systems and Vehicle Operation» (23.03.03, 23.04.03) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Maintenance Support and Vehicles' Repair» (23.02.07) for the period of 6 years.

– **Ufa State Petroleum Technological University**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Applied Computer Science» (09.03.03), «Computer Science and Engineering» (09.04.01) for the period of 6 years.

– **Minin Nizhny Novgorod State Pedagogical University**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Psychological and Pedagogical Education» (44.03.02), «Pedagogical Education (with two educational program specializations)» (44.03.05), «Pedagogical Education» (44.04.01) till December 23, 2028.

4. The fourth issue of the agenda was presented by **G. Motova** on the results of the international external review of clusters of educational programmes (Top accreditation):

– **Peter the Great St.Petersburg Polytechnic University**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 19, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 1.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Civil Engineering» (08.03.01, 08.04.01), «Construction of Unique Buildings and Structures» (08.05.01) for the period of 6 years.

2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Economics» (38.03.01, 38.04.01), «Management» (38.03.02, 38.04.02), «Public Administration» (38.04.04), «Business Informatics» (38.04.05), «Trading Business» (38.04.06) for the period of 6 years.

– **Kazan State Medical University**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Medical Biochemistry» (30.05.01), «Medical Biophysics» (30.05.02) for the period of 6 years.

2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «General Medicine» (31.05.01), «Pediatrics» (31.05.02), «Dentistry» (31.05.03) for the period of 6 years.

3) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Pharmacy» (33.05.01) for the period of 6 years.

– **Gnesin Russian Academy of Music**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 19, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 1.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Jazz and Pop Instrumental Performance» (53.03.01), «Instrumental Music Performance» (53.03.02,

53.04.01), «Vocal Performance» (53.03.03, 53.04.02), «Folk Singing» (53.03.04, 53.04.03), «Conducting» (53.03.05, 53.04.04), «Art» (53.04.05), «Musicology and Musical Applied Arts» (53.03.06, 53.04.06), «Concert Performance» (53.05.01), «Artistic Direction: Symphony Orchestra and Choir» (53.05.02), «Sound Engineering» (53.05.03), «Music Studies» (53.05.05), «Composition» (53.05.06) for the period of 6 years.

5. The fifth issue of the agenda was presented by **G. Motova** on the results of the international external review of a cluster of further education programmes:

– **Federal Institute of Industrial Property**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit a cluster of further education programmes «Intellectual Property in Digital Economy: from the Application to the Implementation», «Training of Experts Engaged in Preliminary Information Search and Preliminary Patentability Assessment of Inventions and Utility Models», «Means of Individualization: Trademarks, Appellations of Origin and Geographical Indications», «Filing an Application for and performing an Examination of Intellectual Property Objects (inventions, utility models, industrial designs and trademarks) in accordance with industry areas», «State Registration of Computer Programs, Databases and Topologies of Integrated Circuits. Disposal of the exclusive right to the above objects», «State Registration of Industrial Designs (in accordance with the requirements of national legislation)», «Training of Experts Engaged in examining Applications for Inventions and Utility Models», «Training of Experts Engaged in examining Applications for Trade Marks», «Current issues in the assessment of intellectual property objects», «Filing an Application for an Invention in the field of Information Technologies», «Certified Technology Transfer Professional», «Introduction to Patent Attorney qualification», «Methodology of Patent Research (Basics)», «Patenting of Pharmaceutical Inventions», «Recommendations for IP Rights Management», «Filing an Application under the PCT system», «Franchising Fundamentals», «Patent Analytics», «Patent Law», «Patent Search» for the period of 4 years.
- 2) To accredit a further education programme «Legal Protection of the Results of Intellectual Activity and IP Rights Management» for the period of 6 years.

6. The sixth issue of the agenda was presented by **G. Motova** on the results of the national external review of clusters of educational programmes:

– **Saint Petersburg Institute of Culture**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 1.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Cultural Studies» (51.03.01), «Museology and Protection of Cultural and Natural Heritage Sites» (51.03.04, 51.04.04), «Library and Information Activity» (51.03.06, 51.04.06) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Folk Art Culture» (51.03.02, 51.04.02), «Social and Cultural Activities» (51.03.03, 51.04.03), «Direction of Theatrical Performances and Holidays» (51.03.05, 51.04.05) for the period of 6 years.

– **Birsk branch of Ufa University of Science and Technology**

Questions were asked.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved:

- 1) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Teacher Education» (44.03.01), «Psychological and Pedagogical Education» (44.03.02), «Special (Defectology) Education» (44.03.03, 44.04.03) for the period of 6 years.
- 2) To accredit the cluster of educational programmes in «Teacher Education (two specializations)» (44.03.05), «Teacher Education» (44.04.01) for the period of 6 years.

7. The seventh issue of the agenda “Other issues” was presented by **V. Bolotov**, who talked about the necessity to hold a Russian round table on introducing institutional public accreditation and developing interdisciplinary cases.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved: to hold a Russian round table on introducing institutional public accreditation and developing interdisciplinary cases.

V. Bolotov suggested to publish in the journal «University Management: Practice and Analysis» the following articles: an article about the specifics of distance learning on biology programmes, and an article about the use of AI in public and international accreditation.

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved: to publish in the journal «University Management: Practice and Analysis» the following articles: an article about the specifics of distance learning on biology programmes, and an article about the use of AI in public and international accreditation.

E. Esentaev suggested to approve the following accreditation terms when carrying out joint accreditations in Kyrgyz HEIs starting from January 2025:

- 5 years (full term),
- 3 years, if 3 standards have a C mark (substantial compliance),
- 1 year, if more than 3 standards have a C mark (partial compliance).

The educational programme is not accredited if at least one standard receives a D mark (non-compliance).

Votes:

«for» - 20, «against» - 0, «abstain» - 0.

Unanimously.

Following the voting results it is resolved: to approve the following accreditation terms when carrying out joint accreditations in Kyrgyz HEIs starting from January 2025:

- 5 years (full term),
- 3 years, if 3 standards have a C mark (substantial compliance),
- 1 year, if more than 3 standards have a C mark (partial compliance).

The educational programme is not accredited if at least one standard receives a D mark (non-compliance).

There was no further business, other issues were not raised.

Chair
of the National Accreditation Board

V. Bolotov

Academic Secretary
of the National Accreditation Board

G. Motova